Department for Transport Road Safety Partnership Grant Scheme 2007-09

Greater Manchester Combined Bid for 17-25 Year Olds

Overall Project Evaluation

Final Report October 2009



Contact Officer:

David Maloney Greater Manchester Joint Road Safety Team 0161 455 2138 <u>d.maloney@manchester.gov.uk</u>

Contents

Executive summary	р З
1 – Introduction	р 6
2 – Statistical Analysis	р7
3 – Anti Drug Drive	p 10
4 – Wrecked	p 15
5 – Hindley Project	p 23
6 – Young Drivers at Work	p 26
7 – Road Safety Officer Interviews	р 30

Executive Summary

<u>Overview</u>

The project saw Road Safety Teams from the ten Greater Manchester authorities work in partnership to address the disproportionate levels of road users killed and seriously injured in the 17-25 age group in the area.

There were three education, training and publicity elements of the project: an Anti Drug Drive publicity campaign, including posters, radio and online publicity; Young Road Users Education and Publicity, which saw a DVD resource produced and delivered to young people, and; Young Drivers at Work, which saw a DVD resource produced and a seminar held for employers of young drivers.

During the life of the project, Greater Manchester saw a decrease in the number of accidents involving drivers aged 17-25. The average annual decrease over the two years was 12.6%. During the same period, the annual average decrease for all drivers was 15.7%. Whilst there was a decrease in accidents involving the target age group, this was less than the decrease across the whole driving population. The global economic downturn was a key factor in this decrease.

Anti Drug Drive campaign

In total 6,500 posters and 400,000 beer mats were distributed to 800 pubs and clubs across Greater Manchester. There were four weeks of radio advertising.

In the absence of detailed Field Impairment Test data, it impossible to measure the impact of the campaign based on recorded offences. An online survey found that about a third of respondents (144, 29%) recognised the campaign, with more than half of those recognising the radio campaign (83, 58%), and a quarter recognising the posters from pubs (36, 25%).

Focus groups suggested improvements to the campaign, including comments on its style, its content and its clarity.

Wrecked

Wrecked, a DVD resource for group work aimed at young road users, was developed by Road Safety Officers, produced, and distributed to more than 100 representatives of appropriate agencies across GM. Many of those instructors attended bespoke training on how to use the resource.

Most young people that completed post-session questionnaires reported that they found Wrecked useful and informative. They said that the resource had

changed how they thought about the risks of driving, and would improve their driving behaviour.

We ran discussion groups with young people who had attended Wrecked sessions, and with the instructors that had delivered sessions. These discussions found that young people thought that Wrecked had:

- Increased their awareness of risk on the road
- Increased their awareness of the consequences of being involved in a road collision
- Affected their sense of responsibility for the safety of oneself and others
- Increased their awareness of the choices faced by road users

The discussion among instructors that had used Wrecked identified some common themes:

- Wrecked engages young people
- Wrecked changes young people's views
- Wrecked is a flexible resource

Following feedback about Wrecked, road safety officers worked with Studio Distract to produce a supplement to the original resource, including scenarios not covered previously, such as quad bike use, shared leased sports cars, TWOC vehicles and driving under the influence of illegal drugs.

Hindley Project

HMP Hindley, in Wigan, is the largest young people's prison in Europe. This project introduced road safety sessions, using the Wrecked resource, as part of the compulsory induction process for all new inmates. The sessions were led by Gears Plus, a local community organisation. Over 200 young people passed through the programme during the life of the project.

Focus groups with instructors suggest that the prison audience responded well to Wrecked, in particular to its format and approach. Focus groups with inmates that had attended sessions were mixed, highlighting that while the sessions made them more aware of the risks they face on the road, there were wider attitudinal issues around re-offending. Building on the success of the induction programme, road safety was integrated in the resettlement syllabus at the prison in June 2009.

Young Drivers at Work

We produced DVD about road safety at work that was that was distributed to businesses across Greater Manchester. Thirty local businesses attended a seminar for local businesses about Work Related Road Safety (WRRS). The session saw presentations from Driving for Better Business, and from a Business Champion, and then a step-by-step guide to devising a WRRS policy.

A survey conducted two weeks after the seminar found that most of the attending businesses had taken steps towards improving their WRRS polices. A series of interviews three months after the event saw a range of responses within companies that attended the seminar: one case study described the challenges presented when implementing widespread organisational change; another attendee became a Business Champion as part of the Driving for Better Business network.

WRRS continues to sit at the forefront of GM road safety activity, with plans to improve health and safety policies in the ten GM local authorities, with the aim of enabling each of them to lead by example in this field.

RSO Interviews

Road Safety Officers shared their opinions of the project at a feedback day. Based on the issues raised, the GMJRST then conducted semi-structured in depth interviews with four of their number. The main themes discussed were partnership working, resources, and evidence-based working.

Road Safety Officers reported that working in a partnership of ten Greater Manchester local authority road safety teams offered substantial benefits to the project.

The interviews offered two lessons for future projects: firstly, consultation with the target audience should partner the analysis of casualty data, rather be subservient to it, when considering possible interventions; secondly, project evaluation should be at the heart of the planning of every intervention, rather than an afterthought 'bolted on' after a project's work is done.

4. 'Wrecked' resource and delivery

Headlines

Wrecked is a DVD resource for group work aimed at young road users. Road Safety Officers worked with Studio Distract, a media company, to develop the resource. It was distributed to more than 100 representatives of appropriate agencies across GM. Many of those instructors attended bespoke training on how to use the resource.

Most young people that completed post-session questionnaires reported that they found Wrecked useful and informative. They said that the resource had changed how they thought about the risks of driving, and would improve their driving behaviour.

We ran discussion groups with young people who had attended Wrecked sessions, which found that young people thought that Wrecked had increased their awareness of risk on the road and of the consequences of being involved in a road collision. They also said that it had affected their sense of responsibility for the safety of oneself and others, and increased their awareness of the choices faced by road users.

A discussion group with instructors that had used Wrecked identified some common themes, namely that Wrecked engages young people, that it changes young people's views, and that it is a flexible resource.

Following feedback about Wrecked, road safety officers worked with Studio Distract to produce a supplement to the original resource, including scenarios not covered previously, such as quad bike use, shared leased sports cars, TWOC vehicles and driving under the influence of illegal drugs.

Wrecked was also used as part of the induction process for young offenders at HMP Hindley. Greater Manchester have continued to forge strong links with the prison, and are currently working on a road safety based programme as part of the pre-release resettlement programme for inmates.

4.1 Project element overview:

The project aimed to reduce KSI in the targeted group by increasing awareness of the potential impact of irresponsible driving. In the first part of the project, we produced an interactive video resource – 'Wrecked' – and associated learning materials. The second part of the project saw 'Wrecked' delivered to young people through three methods. Firstly, the grant funded delivery by specifically hired contractors in some of the GM authority areas. Secondly, organisations that already had access to the target age group received training on how to use the resource, and then included it as part of their 'business as usual' programmes of work. The ten local authority road safety teams paired up, and ran five training sessions for prospective delivery agents from their area. The sessions introduced the resource to the potential delivery agents, and offered advice on how to use it. Thirdly, video was used as part of the induction process with all new inmates at HMP Hindley. This targeted work with young offenders addressed a particularly high-risk group.

4.2 Impact.

The resource was distributed across Greater Manchester. Many of the 'business as usual' organisations did not respond to requests for feedback about the resource. The sample for the feedback provided below is limited, in that it is comprised only of those who chose to respond.

4.2.1 Post session evaluation questionnaires

1757 post-session questionnaires were completed by young people that attended Wrecked sessions.⁷

1 able 3.2.1. Aye al		10003.	r	
Age	Number of	cumlative		
	young people	%	%	
Aged 19+	39	3.5%	3.5%	
Aged 17-19	106	9.5%	13.0%	
Aged 16-17	140	12.5%	25.5%	
Aged 15-16	631	56.4%	81.9%	
Aged 14-15	175	15.7%	97.6%	
Aged 13-14	11	1.0%	98.6%	
Under 13	16	1.4%	100.0%	
Total	1118	100%		
Male	687	44.15%		
Female	869	55.85%		
Total	1556	100%		

Table 3.2.1. Age and gender of attendees.

This table shows that 13% of the respondents were aged 17 plus, and that 82% of the respondents were aged 15 plus. There are two noteworthy points. Firstly, the project was targeted at 17-25 year olds, but Wrecked was also designed to target pre-drivers from year 11: 82% of respondents were in the target age group. Secondly, this data was collected using convenience sampling, i.e. it only reflects the views of young people whose session leaders chose to return their post-session questionnaires. It is therefore heavily weighted towards structured delivery, such as schools and colleges, which

⁷ Not all of the questionnaires were answered in full, which is why some totals are lower. Percentages are shown as proportion of those that answered the question.

have regular homework procedures, and less toward more casual or informal settings, such as youth groups.

All answers are %, most frequent highlighted	Strongly disagree		Disagree		Neither agree nor disagree		Agree		Strongly agree	
	All	17+	All	17+	All	17+	All	17+	All	17+
I found Wrecked useful	1.5	2.1	1.8	2.8	7.3	6.9	60.3	55.6	29.0	32.6
I know more about the legal requirements for driving	1.4	1.4	3.9	9.3	10.7	15.0	59.0	50.7	24.9	23.6
I know more about the consequences of dangerous driving	1.2	2.1	1.7	1.4	7.0	6.3	54.5	52.1	35.7	38.0
I felt I had something in common with the person people in the clip	23.4	21.2	34.2	27.7	22.6	17.5	15.0	24.8	4.6	8.8
Wrecked made me think differently about the risks involved in driving	2.1	5.0	3.7	2.8	11.7	12.1	58.4	51.1	24.2	29.1
*I am less likely to be distracted whilst driving <i>(if currently</i> <i>driving)</i>	4.0	2.8	7.2	5.7	26.5	29.3	44.5	45.2	17.8	17.0
*I will plan my journeys before driving <i>(if currently driving)</i>	5.4	3.7	13.1	13.0	30.6	25.9	38.3	40.7	12.6	16.7
*I will be a safer driver <i>(if currently driving)</i>	3.2	2.8	4.0	4.6	20.0	24.1	48.2	42.6	24.6	25.9

Table 3.2.2 – Responses to Wrecked feedback questionnaires – all ages

*the table shows the percentage of people answered the question, and excludes those who responded "n/a" or failed to respond at all.

The general response, as detailed in the table above, is that most respondents found Wrecked useful and informative, regardless of age. Most respondents thought Wrecked had changed how they thought about the risks of driving, and would improve their driving behaviour. Approximately 90% of all respondents agreed or strongly agreed that Wrecked was useful.

Around 10% fewer of those aged 17+ agreed that Wrecked had improved their knowledge of legal driving requirements, compared to the overall sample. This may reflect a higher base level of knowledge of this issue among the older respondents, of whom 53% were already drivers, or taking lessons. Perception that Wrecked had improved knowledge of the consequences of dangerous driving was similar in both age groups.

4.2.2 Focus groups

The Road Safety Team organised a series of focus groups to provide a detailed insight into the experiences of the instructors and young people who have used Wrecked. They took place in a Further Education College and a Young Offenders Institute Data collected during the focus groups provide evidence that Wrecked has a positive impact on the attitudes of its intended audience.

4.2.2.a Young People

The young people's focus groups took place in a Further Education College and a Young Offenders Institute. Data collected during the discussions provided evidence that Wrecked had a positive impact on the attitudes of its intended audience. A thematic analysis of young people's discussions identified four main themes.

- Increased awareness of risk on the road
- Increased awareness of the consequences of being involved in a road collision
- Increased responsibility for oneself and others
- Increased awareness of the choices faced by road users

Increased awareness of risk on the road describes how Wrecked has provided young people with greater awareness that the road is a risky environment, and greater knowledge of factors that increase risk by impairing driving performance. They are more aware of the need to remain vigilant while driving as the road environment can change so rapidly.

Taking part in Wrecked made young people more aware of roads and other road users being unpredictable, and that the situation can change very rapidly in that what appears a safe environment can suddenly become very dangerous and lead to a collision.

It show how <u>easy</u> it is – like in a split second things can change. It shows how easy it is to be distracted. I think you're bound to [think differently] after seeing something like that: it brings home what can happen in the space of a second. Increased awareness of the consequences of being involved in a road

collision is about Wrecked increasing young people's awareness of what could happen to them and other people if they are involved in a collision. They considered physical, emotional, legal and financial consequences.

Young people were aware that a collision can cause death and serious injury. They discussed outcomes of broken limbs, amputations, being disfigured, and dying. As well as the physical consequences, participants discussed the legal and financial implications of being in a collision or being caught committing a motoring offence.

People not wearing seat belts sat behind you: they end up killing you. They kill themselves too.

As well as the physical consequences, participants discussed the legal and financial implications of being in a collision or being caught committing a motoring offence, and were also aware of the emotional consequences of being in a collision. They discussed the emotional impact that the events had had on the video characters

It doesn't matter if you're in a car or a taxi if you get pulled you've got fine He killed his mate. - Yes, he kills his best mate.

Increased responsibility for oneself and others addresses young people's greater recognition of the need to accept responsibility for their decisions and actions, and their greater sense of responsibility for keeping themselves and other people safe.

They were often surprised at the characters' unwillingness to take the blame for what they had done, which reinforced their own positive attitudes towards taking responsibility.

It was well bad that because he didn't even care, the other chap amputated at the knee.

It was his fault, he was on the phone.

Blamed everybody else but he was to blame.

They discussed how situations can be very complex and the actions of several different people can contribute to a collision, so that there is not a single person who is entirely to blame.

It made you think who was to blame because in a lot of them there was more than one person to blame. *Increased awareness of the choices faced by road users* is about young people showing awareness of the choices that they make on the road.

Young people identified the choices they regularly make, such as the speed they choose to drive at, or whether or not to wear a seat belt. They said that Wrecked had made them more aware of these choices. They were also able to identify more complex choices, such as whether or not to comply with peer pressure, such as to wear a seat belt when nobody else does, or to drive faster. They were also aware of the choices they make as a passenger.

You have a choice about wearing a seat belt. That's another choice, how fast you go, if your passenger goes – go on, go a bit faster – you can say, no it's my car.

They discussed the actions they could take to help themselves make safer choices. Young people clearly understood the main message within Wrecked that a bad decision can have major consequences physically, financially, legally and emotionally.

That video was about would you touch your car after having this much drink, that much drink. What would happen? It's about having points on your licence, fines, talking about that.

4.2.2.b Instructors

All the instructors who took part in the focus group were extremely positive about using Wrecked. Three main themes were identified in their discussions:

- Wrecked engages young people
- Wrecked changes young people's views
- Wrecked is a flexible resource

The instructors also shared opinions about the challenges faced when delivering Wrecked, and about how the resource could be improved.

Wrecked engages young people

All the instructors discussed how young people engage very well with Wrecked. They find it easy to relate to the characters and the situations they describe. This is helped by the actors having local accents, and the events they describe taking place in local areas that young people recognise.

They can identify with somebody who has been at the school that they know, because they are all from the area. Usually it's local knowledge as well, local incidents. I think one of the good things about it was saying where this character actually came from and recognising the accents as well because the accents were their accents.

The instructors felt that young people enjoyed the discussions and debate that followed each of the videos.

It's better to have more discussion with them and I will play a clip and say 'who do you think is at fault there?' and then you'll get an answer and say 'well what do you think? What do you think is right and wrong?' and start having a discussion about it that way

Wrecked changes young people's views

Instructors discussed how they regularly see young people change their views during the course of Wrecked sessions. They described how young people find Wrecked very thought provoking and helps them to reflect upon the decisions that they make.

It's certainly provoking thought. If even it does that for a short period of time, just to get people for that moment to think what they are doing and you can use that to build it up for the future.

They actually change the way they think and look at it for that short period of time whilst you're delivering the course.

The instructors described how they often play "devil's advocate" to get the young people discussing each character's story from different points of view. All the instructors described ways in which they encourage groups to discuss the events in the videos and to challenge their assumptions and their attitudes towards what is safe or acceptable, or who is to blame.

I say 'why's he dead?' 'because he hit a bus' 'yeah but why is he dead?' 'well because he didn't have a seatbelt on.' 'O.K. So he broke the law.' 'Yeah he broke the law, you've got to wear a seatbelt it's the law to wear a seatbelt.' We talk about the front and the back, the usual thing. 'So you want me to feel sorry for him because he broke the law and died? You want me to feel sorry for someone who's nicked a car and killed himself?'

Instructors described how they often see young people change their attitude. They discussed how they don't know whether this attitude shift is maintained over time, and that they would like the opportunity to do a follow-up session with them some months later to find out.

Wrecked is a flexible resource

The instructors all appreciated the way in which Wrecked is inherently flexible. Because each character is a stand-alone activity, they are able to pick and mix the characters to meet the demands of the group, and the time available. Wrecked also works well with a wide range of group sizes, from large classes to small groups of two or three young people.

The key to it is flexibility and how you can tailor it to your audience. That's the key to it and why it's such a good resource.

Wrecked contains a wide range of characters and scenarios so they are always able to pick several that are appropriate to the group they are working with. For example, the instructors talked about how they get some groups to discuss the financial cost of driving and the consequences of losing their licence, but they would not take that approach with a group who steal cars and don't have licences.

Some of these students though, money isn't their main concern, they nick cars don't they? That's what they do. They nick cars and it doesn't cost them anything and they go joy riding. The money terms and the insurance doesn't mean a goddamn thing to them.

Several instructors described how they combine Wrecked with their own material, such as photos of crash scenes, videos of crashes, and road safety adverts. Instructors described how they like to make use of additional material when they have a longer two-hours session as they report that some of the young people they work with – particularly those in a pupil referral unit – find it difficult to concentrate for two hours.

4.3 Lessons learned / next steps

Running training sessions for the new resource was a popular way to introduce it to session leaders, particularly for those not from a road safety background. Fact sheets supporting the resource bridged a knowledge gap on some detailed issues, for example the possible penalties for driving related offences

Road Safety Officers struggled to arrange Wrecked sessions in schools and colleges. This was primarily because academic and financial years don't overlap; by the time that the resource was produced in September, most learning institutions had already planned their extra-curricular programme for the year ahead. The need to align resources within future planning cycles for academic year curricula is crucial. A period of two financial years includes the latter part of one academic year, the whole of a second, and the start of a third. This problem was handled by trying to organise as many Wrecked sessions as possible across GM before the end of the funding period. The funding has a "use it or lose it" quality, but if the academic and funding periods

were more closely aligned, there would have been less of a rush to organise sessions and spend up the money.

By persuading local agencies to integrate delivery of Wrecked sessions alongside their business-as-usual work, we found that, with the right resource, staff with no road safety background could lead road safety sessions. However, our work with schools revealed an interesting point. Even though Wrecked was designed to be used by staff who weren't from a road safety background, most teachers preferred to host an external delivery agent, rather than deliver sessions themselves. Having a new face in the classroom, they said, meant pupils were more likely to respond well. Some teachers weren't confident about the Highway Code, in particular the detail of which penalties applied to which offences. We designed a series of fact sheets⁸ supporting the resource, which addressed this knowledge gap.

A hired contractor, receiving payment for delivering Wrecked, is more likely to submit completed evaluation questionnaires than a 'business as usual' delivery agent, but a 'business as usual' model of delivering the resource is more likely to be sustained after the end of the funding period.

Following the feedback about Wrecked, road safety officers worked with Studio Distract to produce a supplement to the original resource, including scenarios not covered previously, such as quad bike use, shared leased sports cars, TWOC vehicles and driving under the influence of illegal drugs. Two thousand copies have been distributed to road safety teams across GM.

5. Hindley Prison Project

Headlines

HMP Hindley, in Wigan, is the largest young people's prison in Europe. This project introduced road safety sessions, using the Wrecked resources, as part of the compulsory induction process for all new inmates. Over 200 young people passed through the programme during the life of the project.

Focus groups with instructors suggest that the prison audience responded well to Wrecked, in particular to its format and approach. Focus groups with inmates that had attended sessions were mixed, highlighting that while the sessions made them more aware of the risks they face on the road, there were wider attitudinal issues around reoffending. Building on the success of the induction programme, road safety was integrated in the resettlement syllabus at the prison in June 2009.

⁸ The fact sheets were made available online to session leaders via the Wrecked website, and can be viewed at <u>http://wrecked.org.uk/factSheets.html</u>

5.1 Project Description

HMP Hindley, in Wigan, holds approximately 500 juvenile prisoners from across GM and the North-West. It is the largest young people's prison in Europe. More than 80% of inmates have driving related offences⁹. All new inmates go through a week-long induction programme, including sessions on gun crime, substance abuse, and adjusting to prison life.

The project introduced a two hour workshop on road safety as part of the induction process. The workshops covered issues of speed, seatbelts and passengers in vehicles. The sessions were based around three clips from the Wrecked resource, specifically chosen to cover topics that are key contributory factors in the collision data for this age group. Experienced youth workers led the sessions.

5.2 Impact

Focus groups with instructors suggest that the prison audience responded well to Wrecked. They report that the video resource is especially appropriate in the context of the poor literacy skills of the target audience. Wrecked offers stimuli for discussion, rather than clearly delineating right and wrong, which is non-confrontational. The length of the clips – three to five minutes – is also appropriate for the audience, who have a short attention spans.

You've got a short time where you'll get an impact with them and then you need to bring something else in to keep in fresh all the time otherwise their attention span will drift with it.

Instructor, on working at Hindley

Eight young men who had attended a Wrecked session as part of their induction at Hindley earlier in the year took part in the focus group about the sessions. One was 15 years old, one 16, and the remaining six were 17. One had a driving licence, although several had driven in the past. Two reported that had been convicted of motoring offences. The concept of taking responsibility to keep your passengers safe was apparent in their discussions. They showed greater willingness to take responsibility for keeping their friends safe than to keep themselves safe. However, some discussed that while Wrecked had made them more aware of the risks they face on the road, they anticipate that they would revert to their old ways of thinking and behaving when they leave the Young Offenders Institute.

The following exchange highlights the tension between acknowledging the risk involved in the situation and wanting to revert to their previous ways of behaving.

⁹ Some will be serving time for their vehicle-related offences, others will be serving time for other offences, but will have vehicle-related crime as part of their offending history.

You think s*** like that won't happen to you.

You shouldn't think like that anyway because if you're going to think like that, you know what I'm saying, you don't care.

But you're going to do the same when you get back out.

When I get out and get in my seat I'm not going to be thinking of anything except wheel spinning, do-nuts.

Hindley

The language used by some of the young people indicate that they have resigned themselves to repeat offending. There is a discourse that suggests that they have defined themselves as "bad boys" who have not listened to warnings in the past and who therefore cannot or will not listen to warnings now, road safety or otherwise.

This is indicative of the kind of the difficulties faced when working with young offenders. Overcoming barriers to attitudinal change is the aim of the resettlement and rehabilitation process across the entire offender management system, and as such it is beyond the scope of the project to address these barriers. Our research suggests that the discussions involved in Wrecked might be used as part of a larger intervention to make long-lasting changes to help prevent young people re-offending.

5.3 Lessons learned

Building on the success of the induction programme, road safety was integrated in the resettlement syllabus at the prison in June 2009. Resettlement covers the course of study that prisoners attend and often must successfully pass as a condition of their release. Road safety sessions are delivered to small groups of prisoners who have chosen to attend due to related offences, or because of an interest in driving related issues, The sessions are delivered by experienced youth workers, and are fully supported by the Prison service.

Wigan Road Safety manage the resettlement project on behalf of the ten Greater Manchester local authorities. The relationship between the partnership and the prison service continues to develop.